

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON NEXT PAGE OF THIS FORM.)

I. (a) PLAINTIFFS

Chu, Yiatin; et al. (see attachment)

(b) County of Residence of First Listed Plaintiff Queens County
(EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)

(c) Attorneys (Firm Name, Address, and Telephone Number)

Caleb J. Kruckenberg, Pacific Legal Foundation,
3100 Clarendon Blvd., Suite 1000, Arlington, VA 22201
202 888 6881**II. BASIS OF JURISDICTION** (Place an "X" in One Box Only)

- | | |
|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 3 Federal Question
(U.S. Government Not a Party) |
| <input type="checkbox"/> 2 U.S. Government Defendant | <input type="checkbox"/> 4 Diversity
(Indicate Citizenship of Parties in Item III) |

III. CITIZENSHIP OF PRINCIPAL PARTIES (Place an "X" in One Box for Plaintiff and One Box for Defendant)

	PTF	DEF	PTF	DEF	
Citizen of This State	<input type="checkbox"/> 1	<input type="checkbox"/> 1	Incorporated or Principal Place of Business In This State	<input type="checkbox"/> 4	<input type="checkbox"/> 4
Citizen of Another State	<input type="checkbox"/> 2	<input type="checkbox"/> 2	Incorporated and Principal Place of Business In Another State	<input type="checkbox"/> 5	<input type="checkbox"/> 5
Citizen or Subject of a Foreign Country	<input type="checkbox"/> 3	<input type="checkbox"/> 3	Foreign Nation	<input type="checkbox"/> 6	<input type="checkbox"/> 6

IV. NATURE OF SUIT (Place an "X" in One Box Only)

CONTRACT	TORTS	FORFEITURE/PENALTY	BANKRUPTCY	OTHER STATUTES
<input type="checkbox"/> 110 Insurance	PERSONAL INJURY	PERSONAL INJURY	<input type="checkbox"/> 625 Drug Related Seizure of Property 21 USC 881	<input type="checkbox"/> 422 Appeal 28 USC 158
<input type="checkbox"/> 120 Marine	<input type="checkbox"/> 310 Airplane	<input type="checkbox"/> 365 Personal Injury - Product Liability	<input type="checkbox"/> 690 Other	<input type="checkbox"/> 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157
<input type="checkbox"/> 130 Miller Act	<input type="checkbox"/> 315 Airplane Product Liability	<input type="checkbox"/> 367 Health Care/ Pharmaceutical Personal Injury		INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS
<input type="checkbox"/> 140 Negotiable Instrument	<input type="checkbox"/> 320 Assault, Libel & Slander	<input type="checkbox"/> 330 Federal Employers' Liability	<input type="checkbox"/> 820 Copyrights	<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
<input type="checkbox"/> 150 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgment	<input type="checkbox"/> 340 Marine	<input type="checkbox"/> 368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability	<input type="checkbox"/> 830 Patent	<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
<input type="checkbox"/> 151 Medicare Act	<input type="checkbox"/> 345 Marine Product Liability	<input type="checkbox"/> 370 Other Fraud	<input type="checkbox"/> 835 Patent - Abbreviated New Drug Application	<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
<input type="checkbox"/> 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excludes Veterans)	<input type="checkbox"/> 350 Motor Vehicle	<input type="checkbox"/> 371 Truth in Lending	<input type="checkbox"/> 840 Trademark	<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
<input type="checkbox"/> 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits	<input type="checkbox"/> 355 Motor Vehicle	<input type="checkbox"/> 380 Other Personal Property Damage	<input type="checkbox"/> 880 Defend Trade Secrets Act of 2016	<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
<input type="checkbox"/> 160 Stockholders' Suits	<input type="checkbox"/> 360 Other Personal Injury	<input type="checkbox"/> 385 Property Damage Product Liability		<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
<input type="checkbox"/> 190 Other Contract	<input type="checkbox"/> 362 Personal Injury - Medical Malpractice			<input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692)
<input type="checkbox"/> 195 Contract Product Liability				<input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act
<input type="checkbox"/> 196 Franchise				<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act
REAL PROPERTY	CIVIL RIGHTS	PRIISONER PETITIONS		
<input type="checkbox"/> 210 Land Condemnation	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 440 Other Civil Rights	Habeas Corpus:	<input type="checkbox"/> 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157	<input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))
<input type="checkbox"/> 220 Foreclosure	<input type="checkbox"/> 441 Voting	<input type="checkbox"/> 463 Alien Detainee		<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
<input type="checkbox"/> 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment	<input type="checkbox"/> 442 Employment	<input type="checkbox"/> 510 Motions to Vacate Sentence		<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
<input type="checkbox"/> 240 Torts to Land	<input type="checkbox"/> 443 Housing/ Accommodations	<input type="checkbox"/> 530 General		<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
<input type="checkbox"/> 245 Tort Product Liability	<input type="checkbox"/> 445 Amer. w/Disabilities - Employment	<input type="checkbox"/> 535 Death Penalty		<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
<input type="checkbox"/> 290 All Other Real Property	<input type="checkbox"/> 446 Amer. w/Disabilities - Other	<input type="checkbox"/> 540 Mandamus & Other		<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
	<input type="checkbox"/> 448 Education	<input type="checkbox"/> 550 Civil Rights		<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
		<input type="checkbox"/> 555 Prison Condition		<input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692)
		<input type="checkbox"/> 560 Civil Detainee - Conditions of Confinement		<input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act
IMMIGRATION				
		<input type="checkbox"/> 462 Naturalization Application		<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act
		<input type="checkbox"/> 465 Other Immigration Actions		<input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))
FEDERAL TAX SUITS				
			<input type="checkbox"/> 870 Taxes (U.S. Plaintiff or Defendant)	<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
			<input type="checkbox"/> 871 IRS—Third Party	<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
			26 USC 7609	<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
				<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
				<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
				<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
				<input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692)
				<input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))
				<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
				<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
				<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
				<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
				<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
				<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
				<input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692)
				<input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))
				<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
				<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
				<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
				<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
				<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
				<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
				<input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692)
				<input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))
				<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
				<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
				<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
				<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
				<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
				<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
				<input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692)
				<input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))
				<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
				<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
				<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
				<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
				<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
				<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
				<input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692)
				<input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))
				<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
				<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
				<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
				<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
				<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
				<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
				<input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692)
				<input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))
				<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
				<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
				<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
				<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
				<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
				<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
				<input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692)
				<input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))
				<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
				<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
				<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
				<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
				<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
				<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
				<input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692)
				<input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))
				<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
				<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
				<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
				<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
				<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
				<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
				<input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692)
				<input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))
				<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
				<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
				<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
				<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
				<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
				<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
				<input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692)
				<input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))
				<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
				<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
				<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
				<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
				<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
				<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
				<input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692)
				<input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))
				<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
				<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
				<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
				<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
				<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
				<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
				<input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692)
				<input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))
				<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
				<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
				<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
				<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
				<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
				<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
				<input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692)
				<input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))
				<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
				<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
				<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
				<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
				<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
				<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
				<input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692)
				<input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))
				<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
				<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
				<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
				<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
				<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
				<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
				<input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692)
				<input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))
				<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
				<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
				<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
				<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
				<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
				<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
				<input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692)
				<input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))
				<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
				<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
				<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
				<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
				<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
				<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
				<input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692)
				<input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))
				<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
				<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
				<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
				<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
				<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
				<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
				<input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692)
				<input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))
				<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
				<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
				<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
				<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
				<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
				<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
				<input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692)
				<input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act
				<input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))
				<input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment
				<input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust
				<input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking
				<input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce
				<input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation
				<input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations
		</		

INSTRUCTIONS FOR ATTORNEYS COMPLETING CIVIL COVER SHEET FORM JS 44

Authority For Civil Cover Sheet

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replaces nor supplements the filings and service of pleading or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. Consequently, a civil cover sheet is submitted to the Clerk of Court for each civil complaint filed. The attorney filing a case should complete the form as follows:

- I.(a) Plaintiffs-Defendants.** Enter names (last, first, middle initial) of plaintiff and defendant. If the plaintiff or defendant is a government agency, use only the full name or standard abbreviations. If the plaintiff or defendant is an official within a government agency, identify first the agency and then the official, giving both name and title.
- (b) County of Residence.** For each civil case filed, except U.S. plaintiff cases, enter the name of the county where the first listed plaintiff resides at the time of filing. In U.S. plaintiff cases, enter the name of the county in which the first listed defendant resides at the time of filing. (NOTE: In land condemnation cases, the county of residence of the "defendant" is the location of the tract of land involved.)
- (c) Attorneys.** Enter the firm name, address, telephone number, and attorney of record. If there are several attorneys, list them on an attachment, noting in this section "(see attachment)".

- II. Jurisdiction.** The basis of jurisdiction is set forth under Rule 8(a), F.R.Cv.P., which requires that jurisdictions be shown in pleadings. Place an "X" in one of the boxes. If there is more than one basis of jurisdiction, precedence is given in the order shown below.
 United States plaintiff. (1) Jurisdiction based on 28 U.S.C. 1345 and 1348. Suits by agencies and officers of the United States are included here.
 United States defendant. (2) When the plaintiff is suing the United States, its officers or agencies, place an "X" in this box.
 Federal question. (3) This refers to suits under 28 U.S.C. 1331, where jurisdiction arises under the Constitution of the United States, an amendment to the Constitution, an act of Congress or a treaty of the United States. In cases where the U.S. is a party, the U.S. plaintiff or defendant code takes precedence, and box 1 or 2 should be marked.
 Diversity of citizenship. (4) This refers to suits under 28 U.S.C. 1332, where parties are citizens of different states. When Box 4 is checked, the citizenship of the different parties must be checked. (See Section III below; **NOTE: federal question actions take precedence over diversity cases.**)

- III. Residence (citizenship) of Principal Parties.** This section of the JS 44 is to be completed if diversity of citizenship was indicated above. Mark this section for each principal party.

- IV. Nature of Suit.** Place an "X" in the appropriate box. If there are multiple nature of suit codes associated with the case, pick the nature of suit code that is most applicable. Click here for: [Nature of Suit Code Descriptions](#).

- V. Origin.** Place an "X" in one of the seven boxes.
 Original Proceedings. (1) Cases which originate in the United States district courts.
 Removed from State Court. (2) Proceedings initiated in state courts may be removed to the district courts under Title 28 U.S.C., Section 1441.
 Remanded from Appellate Court. (3) Check this box for cases remanded to the district court for further action. Use the date of remand as the filing date.
 Reinstated or Reopened. (4) Check this box for cases reinstated or reopened in the district court. Use the reopening date as the filing date.
 Transferred from Another District. (5) For cases transferred under Title 28 U.S.C. Section 1404(a). Do not use this for within district transfers or multidistrict litigation transfers.
 Multidistrict Litigation – Transfer. (6) Check this box when a multidistrict case is transferred into the district under authority of Title 28 U.S.C. Section 1407.
 Multidistrict Litigation – Direct File. (8) Check this box when a multidistrict case is filed in the same district as the Master MDL docket.
PLEASE NOTE THAT THERE IS NOT AN ORIGIN CODE 7. Origin Code 7 was used for historical records and is no longer relevant due to changes in statute.

- VI. Cause of Action.** Report the civil statute directly related to the cause of action and give a brief description of the cause. **Do not cite jurisdictional statutes unless diversity.** Example: U.S. Civil Statute: 47 USC 553 Brief Description: Unauthorized reception of cable service.

- VII. Requested in Complaint.** Class Action. Place an "X" in this box if you are filing a class action under Rule 23, F.R.Cv.P.
 Demand. In this space enter the actual dollar amount being demanded or indicate other demand, such as a preliminary injunction.
 Jury Demand. Check the appropriate box to indicate whether or not a jury is being demanded.

- VIII. Related Cases.** This section of the JS 44 is used to reference related pending cases, if any. If there are related pending cases, insert the docket numbers and the corresponding judge names for such cases.

Date and Attorney Signature. Date and sign the civil cover sheet.

Attachment to Civil Cover Sheet

PLAINTIFFS:

Chu, Yiatin; Chinese American Citizens Alliance of Greater New York; Inclusive Education Advocacy Group; Higher with Our Parent Engagement

DEFENDANT:

New York State Education Department, Rosa, Betty A., in her official capacity as Commissioner of Education for the State of New York